

Small business owners with employees at diverse ages and life stages often face a common question: **Should I offer a traditional small group health insurance plan or an HRA (Health Reimbursement Arrangement) paired with individual coverage?** The answer is not straightforward. [small group market eligibility](#) It depends on eligibility, employee choice preferences, tax credits, and the realities of purchase channels like the *SHOP Marketplace* and direct carrier options.



Drawing from 12 years of experience helping micro-businesses with 1-25 employees navigate these decisions, including managing renewals and employee questions firsthand, this post breaks down:

- Core definitions and distinctions between HRAs and group plans
- Employee eligibility and benefit plan design choices
- The role and limits of the **SHOP Marketplace**
- Small Business Health Care Tax Credit rules and how they influence purchase decisions
- Key purchase routes: off-exchange vs on-exchange (and what that actually means)
- Mini-scenarios highlighting how different life stages impact optimal plan choice

Defining Terms Before We Dive In

Let's first define critical terms that often get confused but are essential for informed decisions.

What is an HRA?

A **Health Reimbursement Arrangement (HRA)** is an employer-funded account used to reimburse employees for qualified medical expenses — including premiums for individual health plans. Importantly, the employee typically selects their own insurance plan, and the employer controls the contribution amount, i.e., a *defined contribution* approach.

What is a Group Health Insurance Plan?

A **group health plan** is coverage purchased by an employer that covers a defined employee group — usually all or most employees — under a single policy through a carrier. These plans may be purchased:

- On the **SHOP Marketplace** (an ACA-compliant small group marketplace)
- Directly from insurance carriers *off-exchange*

Unlike an HRA, employees generally do not shop for individual coverage themselves but collectively receive the group plan benefits.

Key Distinction: On-exchange vs Off-exchange

Purchasing a plan *on-exchange* means through a state or federal marketplace, such as the SHOP Marketplace for small groups. Buying *off-exchange* means purchasing directly from carriers outside of the marketplace.

This distinction is a purchase *route*, not a mark of better or worse plan quality.

Eligibility: Individual vs Small Group and Employee Types

Understanding eligibility is critical since it dictates what coverage options are legally available to a business and its employees.

Individual Coverage Eligibility

- Any individual can buy an individual health insurance policy on or off the exchange.
- Employers may offer an HRA to reimburse employees for individual plan premiums.
- Owner-only businesses (sole proprietors, single-owner LLCs with no common-law employees) often rely on individual coverage plus an HRA for benefits.

Small Group Eligibility

- Businesses with 1-50 employees (varies by state) qualify for small group health insurance plans.
- “Common-law employees” must be eligible for group coverage if the business offers it; owner-only help matters here.
- Small group plans must be offered to all eligible employees, with employer contribution rules and coverage mandates.

Mini-Scenario: Owner-Only Company

- *Mary owns a landscaping business, no employees. She can buy individual coverage for herself and use an HRA if she chooses.*
- Group plans typically aren’t offered or beneficial here since no employees are present.

Mini-Scenario: Diverse Employee Ages

- *John owns a creative agency with 8 employees aged 22 to 55. Younger employees want lower premiums and flexibility; some older ones prefer more comprehensive group coverage.*
- Offering an HRA plus individual coverage empowers each employee to pick plans that fit their life stage, but small group plans provide uniform coverage and prevent adverse selection.

SHOP Marketplace: Basics and Availability Limits

The **SHOP Marketplace** (Small Business Health Options Program) is a government-run health insurance marketplace for small employers to shop and buy ACA-compliant group coverage.

Why Buy on the SHOP Marketplace?

- Allows access to the **Small Business Health Care Tax Credit** (more on that below)
- Small employers can browse competing plans side-by-side
- In some states, employee choice of benefit tiers is allowed

Limits and Challenges With SHOP

- Only businesses with 1-50 full-time equivalent employees (limits vary by state) are eligible
- Must cover at least 70% of eligible employees (employee participation requirement)
- Plans are limited to those offered on the marketplace in the employer's county
- Not all carriers participate in all counties or states

Mini-Scenario: Missing Preferred Carrier

- *Sarah's microbusiness is eligible for SHOP, but her favorite local regional carrier doesn't offer plans on SHOP in her county.*
- She may shop direct with that carrier off-exchange but lose SHOP tax credits and unified plan options.

The Small Business Health Care Tax Credit: Why It Matters

You know what's funny? the small business health care tax credit rewards small employers who buy aca-compliant group coverage for their employees by offsetting a large portion of the premiums. This is a heavy driver in the group vs HRA decision.

Tax Credit Basics

- Available only for **small employers with 1-25 full-time equivalent (FTE) employees**
- Employees must generally make an average wage of <\$60,000/year (indexed annually)
- Employers must pay at least 50% of employee-only premiums
- Applies **only to premiums for eligible small group plans purchased on the SHOP Marketplace**
- Tax credit can be worth up to 50% (35% for tax-exempt employers) of the employer's premium costs

Why Tax Credit Drives Decision

- *If you buy individual coverage plus an HRA, employers normally **cannot claim this tax credit**, since individual coverage isn't a small group plan purchase.*
- Offering a small group plan through SHOP with required employer contributions secures access to the credit.
- However, employees may prefer the defined contribution flexibility of an HRA if tax credits are less valuable or the group plan cost is high.

Mini-Scenario: Choosing Between Tax Credit and Flexibility

- *Andy's company qualifies for the full tax credit by purchasing a SHOP group plan, saving thousands annually in premiums.*
- *However, his younger employees want diverse Aetna and Kaiser individual plans off-exchange, which the group plan doesn't offer.*
- *Andy weighs forfeiting the tax credit in exchange for an HRA to boost employee satisfaction with choice.*

Employee Choice and Defined Contribution: The HRA Advantage

Employee choice refers to allowing employees to pick individual plans that suit their health needs and budget.

Defined contribution means the employer offers a set reimbursement amount, letting employees buy coverage individually rather than mandating a one-size-fits-all group plan.

Benefits of Providing an HRA With Individual Coverage

- Employees can choose plans that fit their life stage—e.g., young singles may pick high-deductible plans; older workers may want comprehensive coverage.
- Employee satisfaction often improves with choice and flexibility.
- Employers can control costs with fixed monthly contributions.
- Minimizes adverse selection risk inherent in group plan risk pooling.

Downsides

- Loss of small business tax credit if not paired properly
- Potential compliance complexity (must comply with IRS rules for HRAs linked to individual coverage)
- Employees might encounter different carrier networks, possibly complicating administration and eligibility verification

Comparing Key Features: HRA + Individual Coverage vs Small Group Plan

Feature	HRA + Individual Coverage	Small Group Plan (SHOP or Direct)	Purchase Route	Individual market
on or off exchange	on or off exchange	SHOP or off-exchange	carrier	Employee Choice
High - employees choose their own plans	Limited - one or a few group plans offered	Defined Contribution	Yes - employer sets reimbursement amount	No - employers typically pay % of group premiums
Small Business Tax Credit Eligibility	Typically no	Yes, if purchased via SHOP	Employee Eligibility	All eligible employees with individual coverage
Carrier Network Complexity	Varies by employee; may increase admin complexity	Uniform coverage from one carrier/network	Compliance	Must follow IRS rules on HRAs and ACA
Group plan compliance	per ACA/ERISA			

Making the Decision: Factors to Weigh

Use this simple decision tree to determine when an HRA or group plan is better based on your business scenario:

1. Do you have common-law employees?

- No: HRA + individual coverage is likely best (owner-only or 1099 contractors)
- Yes: Go to 2

2. Do you qualify for the Small Business Health Care Tax Credit and value it?

- Yes: Small group plan on SHOP Marketplace is generally better
- No: Go to 3

3. Do your employees prefer choice or uniform coverage?

- Choice: Consider HRA paired with individual plans

- Uniform benefits: Offer a small group plan through SHOP or direct carrier

4. Are preferred carriers/plans available via SHOP?

- No: Buying off-exchange group plans or HRAs may be necessary
- Yes: Consider SHOP plans to maximize benefits and tax credits

Final Thoughts

To circle back to the question: *Is an HRA better than a group plan for employees in different life stages?* The truth is nuanced.



- **HRA + individual coverage:** Offers flexibility and personalized choice, especially great for microbusinesses with a mix of young and older employees, or owner-only companies.
- **Small group plan on SHOP:** Secures valuable tax credits, simplifies administration, and provides stable coverage but with less individual choice.

Choosing the best option means understanding your company's size, employee demographics, carrier availability, and your appetite for tax credits versus employee choice. Leveraging the **SHOP Marketplace** when eligible can be a powerful tool, but remember that buying *off-exchange* direct from carriers or employing defined contribution HRAs each have their place.

Pro tip: Always assess how your employees' individual health needs align with plan options. Sometimes a hybrid approach—offering a baseline group plan plus HRAs or voluntary benefits—can serve diverse workforces best.

For personalized help navigating your specific county and carrier options, including payroll and benefits integration, don't hesitate to reach out to an experienced broker familiar with your unique market nuances.